

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

**IN RE BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD
ANTITRUST LITIGATION
MDL 2406**

: Master File 2:13-cv-20000-RDP
:
:
: This document relates to
: Subscriber Track cases
:

SUBSCRIBER PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY

Subscriber Plaintiffs respectfully submit this Notice of Supplemental Authority to alert the Court to the recent decision by the United States Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit in *Shiyang Huang, et al v. Equifax Inc., et al.*, No. 20-10249 (June 3, 2021), a copy of which is attached hereto. As relevant here, the Court of Appeals in *Equifax* affirmed the District Court's decision to grant final approval to a settlement agreement that resolved the claims asserted on behalf of the class of victims of the 2017 data privacy breach of Equifax Inc., and it also affirmed the District Court's approval of class counsel's application for attorney's fees of \$77.5 million, which amounted to over 20 percent of the \$380.5 million common settlement "megafund" created for the class.

The decision, which was handed down less than a week after counsel for Subscriber Plaintiffs submitted their motion for approval of their attorney's fees and expenses application, strongly supports Subscriber Counsel's analysis of the factors governing this Court's review of their fee application and confirms the reasonableness of the requested percentage award. Among other things, the Court of Appeals reaffirmed that district courts in this Circuit should use the percentage method (and not the lodestar method) to evaluate proposed fee awards in common fund

settlements, Slip Op. at 52-54; *see id.* at 53 (“The percentage method therefore remains the proper method to apply when awarding attorney’s fees in common fund settlement cases.”), and that 25 percent remains the benchmark percentage award, *id.* at 57, n.28. The Court of Appeals also reaffirmed that a trial court is required to consider the 12 *Johnson* factors when assessing the reasonableness of a percentage award, *id.* at 50-51, and is not required (although is permitted) to perform a lodestar cross-check when assessing such a fee request, *id.* at 54-55 n.26. Finally, the Court of Appeals declined to add a separate requirement that the courts expressly consider so-called “economies of scale” to reduce a percentage award in “megafund” cases, *id.* at 55-56, recognizing that courts have repeatedly awarded fees at or above the 25 percent benchmark in such cases, *id.* at 56-57, and acknowledging that such a sliding scale approach “provides no direction to courts about when to start decreasing the percentage award, nor by how much,” and “could also create ‘perverse incentives’ as it may encourage class counsel to pursue ‘quick settlements at sub-optimal levels.’” Id. at 55 (quoting 5 Newberg § 15.80).

In all of these respects, the Court of Appeals’ decision confirms and reinforces the points made by Subscribers Counsel in their memorandum in support of the fee application. *See, e.g.*, ECF No. 2733-1 at 30-34 (percentage method used in common fund cases); 31 (discussing the 25 percent benchmark); 39-64 (application of the *Johnson* factors establishes reasonableness of proposed fee award); 64-66 (lodestar cross-check confirms reasonableness of proposed fee award); 67-74 (use of sliding scale would create perverse incentives).

The Court’s opinion also provides guidance and clarification regarding the standards that govern both class certification and final settlement approval, and Subscriber Plaintiffs intend to

fully address all of these elements of the *Equifax* decision, as appropriate, when we file our motion for final approval of the settlement later this year.¹

Dated: June 9, 2021

/s/ David Boies
David Boies – ***Co-Lead Counsel***
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP
333 Main Street
Armonk, NY 10504
Tel: (914) 749-8200
Fax: (914) 749-8200
dboies@bsflp.com

Charles J. Cooper – ***Co-Chair, Written Submissions Committee & PSC Member***
COOPER & KIRK, PLLC
1523 New Hampshire Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20036
Tel: (202) 220-9600
Fax: (202) 220-9601
ccooper@cooperkirk.com

Chris T. Hellums – ***Local Facilitating Counsel***
PITTMAN, DUTTON & HELLUMS, P.C.
2001 Park Place N, 1100 Park Place Tower
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 322-8880
Fax: (205) 328-2711
chrish@pittmandutton.com

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Michael D. Hausfeld
Michael D. Hausfeld – ***Co-Lead Counsel***
Swathi Bojedla – ***Discovery Committee***
HAUSFELD LLP
888 16th Street, N.W., Suite 300
Washington, DC 20006
Tel: (202) 540-7200
Fax: (202) 540-7201
mhausfeld@hausfeld.com
sbojedla@hausfeld.com

Megan Jones – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***
Arthur Bailey – ***Discovery Committee***
HAUSFELD LLP
600 Montgomery Street, Suite 3200
San Francisco, CA 94111
Tel: (415) 633-1908
Fax: (415) 358-4980
mjones@hausfeld.com
abailey@hausfeld.com

William A. Isaacson – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***
PAUL WEISS
2001 K Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006-1047
Tel: (202) 223-7313
Fax: (202) 379-4937
wisaacson@bsflp.com

¹ A petition for rehearing and suggestion for rehearing *en banc* has been filed by one of the Appellants in *Equifax*, arguing that the panel erred with respect to jurisdictional issues that are not relevant to this case. See Appellant Shiyang Huang's Petition for Rehearing and for Rehearing *En Banc*, *Shiyang Huang, et al v. Equifax Inc., et al.*, No. 20-10249 (Filed June 7, 2021).

Gregory Davis – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***
DAVIS & TALIAFERRO, LLC
7031 Halcyon Park Drive
Montgomery, AL 36117
Tel: (334) 832-9080
Fax: (334) 409-7001
gldavis@knology.net

Kathleen Chavez – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***
FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O’NEIL, LLC
10 West State Street, Suite 200
Geneva, IL 60134
Tel: (630) 797-3339
Fax: (630) 232-7452
kcc@fmcolaw.com

Carl S. Kravitz – ***Expert Committee***
ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER LLP
1800 M Street NW, Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20036-5807
Tel: (202) 778-1800
Fax: (202) 822-8106
c.kravitz@zuckerman.com

Mindee Reuben
LITE DEPALMA GREENBERG
1835 Market Street, Suite 2700
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Tel: (267) 314-7980
Fax: (973) 623-0858
mreubin@litedepalma.com

Cyril V. Smith – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***
ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER, LLP
100 East Pratt Street, Suite 2440
Baltimore, MD 21202-1031
Tel: (410) 949-1145
Fax: (410) 659-0436
csmith@zuckerman.com

David Guin – ***Co-Chair, Written Submissions Committee***
Tammy Stokes – ***Damages Committee***
GUIN, STOKES & EVANS, LLC
300 Richard Arrington Jr. Blvd. North
Suite 600/Title Building
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 226-2282
Fax: (205) 226-2357
davidg@gseattorneys.com
tammym@gseattorneys.com

Richard Feinstein – ***Expert Committee***
Karen Dyer – ***Expert Committee***
Hamish P.M. Hume – ***Discovery Committee***
BOIES, SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP
1401 New York Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20005
Tel: (202) 237-2727
Fax: (202) 237-6131
rfeinstein@bsflp.com
kdyer@bsflp.com
hhume@bsflp.com

Nate Cihlar
Joshua Callister
STRAUSS & BOIES
4041 University Drive, 5th Floor
Fairfax, VA 22030
Tel: (703) 764-8700
Fax: (703) 764-8704
ncihlar@straus-boies.com
jcallister@straus-boies.com

Patrick Cafferty – ***Discovery Committee***
CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER &
SPRENGEL LLP
150 S. Wacker Drive, Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60606
Tel: (312) 782-4880
pcafferty@caffertyclobes.com

Andrew Lemmon – ***Chair, Discovery Committee***
LEMMON LAW FIRM
15058 River Road
PO Box 904
Hahnville, LA 70057
Tel: (985) 783-6789
Fax: (985) 783-1333
andrew@lemonnlawfirm.com

Douglas Dellaccio – ***Litigation Committee***
CORY WATSON CROWDER & DEGARIS,
P.C.
2131 Magnolia Avenue, Suite 200
Birmingham, AL 32505
Tel: (205) 328-2200
Fax: (205) 324-7896
ddellaccio@cwcd.com

Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr.
Benjamin Sweet – ***Litigation Committee***
DEL SOLE CAVANAUGH STROYD LLC
200 First Avenue, Suite 300
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
Tel: (412) 261-2393
Fax: (412) 261-2110
ekilpela@dsclaw.com
bsweet@dsclaw.com

Bryan Clobes – ***Litigation Committee***
Ellen Meriwether – ***Written Submissions Committee***
CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER &
SPRENGEL LLP
2005 North Monroe Street
Media, PA 19063
Tel: (215) 864-2800
Fax: (215) 864-2810
bclobes@caffertyclobes.com
emeriwether@caffertyclobes.com

Virginia Buchanan – ***Chair, Class Certification Committee***
LEVIN PAPANTONIO THOMAS
MITCHELL RAFFERTY & PROCTOR, P.A.
316 South Baylen Street, Suite 600
Pensacola, FL 32502
Tel: (850) 435-7000
Fax: (850) 435-7020
vbuchanan@levinlaw.com

Larry McDevitt – ***Chair, Class Certification Committee***
David Wilkerson – ***Discovery Committee***
VAN WINKLE LAW FIRM
11 North Market Street
Asheville, NC 28801
Tel: (828) 258-2991
lmcdevitt@vwlawfirm.com
dwilkerson@vwlawfirm.com

Robert M. Foote – ***Damages Committee***
FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O'NEIL,
LLC
10 West State Street, Suite 200
Geneva, IL 60134
Tel: (630) 797-3339
Fax: (630) 232-7452
rmf@fmcolaw.com

Charles T. Caliendo – ***Class Certification Committee***
GRANT & EISENHOFER
485 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10017
Tel: (646) 722-8500
Fax: (646) 722-8501
ccaliendo@gelaw.com

Daniel Gustafson – ***Litigation Committee***
Daniel C. Hedlund – ***Damages Committee***
GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC
120 South Sixth Street, Suite 2600
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Tel: (612) 333-8844
Fax: (612) 339-6622
dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com
dhedlund@gustafsongluek.com

John Saxon – ***Litigation Committee***
JOHN D. SAXON, P.C.
2119 3rd Avenue North
Birmingham, AL 35203-3314
Tel: (205) 324-0223
Fax: (205) 323-1583
jsaxon@saxonattorneys.com

Robert Methvin – ***Chair, Settlement Committee***
James M. Terrell – ***Class Certification Committee***
MCCALLUM, METHVIN & TERRELL, P.C.
The Highland Building
2201 Arlington Avenue South
Birmingham, AL 35205
Tel: (205) 939-0199
Fax: (205) 939-0399
rgm@mmlaw.net
jterrell@mmlaw.net

Robert Eisler – ***Discovery Committee***
GRANT & EISENHOFER
123 Justison Street
Wilmington, DE 19801
Tel: (302) 622-7000
Fax: (302) 622-7100
reisler@gelaw.com

Brent Hazzard – ***Litigation Committee***
HAZZARD LAW, LLC
447 Northpark Drive
Ridgeland, MS 39157
Tel: (601) 977-5253
Fax: (601) 977-5236
brenthazzard@yahoo.com

Lawrence Jones – ***Damages Committee***
JONES WARD PLC
The Pointe
1205 East Washington Street, Suite 111
Louisville, Kentucky 40206
Tel: (502) 882-6000
Fax: (502) 587-2007
larry@jonesward.com

Michael McGartland – ***Class Certification Committee***
MCGARTLAND & BORCHARDT LLP
1300 South University Drive, Suite 500
Fort Worth, TX 76107
Tel: (817) 332-9300
Fax: (817) 332-9301
mike@attorneysmb.com

H. Lewis Gillis – ***Co-Head Chair, Litigation Committee***
MEANS GILLIS LAW, LLC
3121 Zelda Court
Montgomery, AL 36106
Tel: 1-800-626-9684
hlgillis@tmgslaw.com

David J. Hodge – ***Chair, Settlement Committee***
MORRIS, KING & HODGE
200 Pratt Avenue NE
Huntsville, AL 35801
Tel: (256) 536-0588
Fax: (256) 533-1504
lstewart@alinjurylaw.com

Dianne M. Nast – ***Class Certification Committee***
NASTLAW LLC
1101 Market Street, Suite 2801
Philadelphia, PA 19107
Tel: (215) 923-9300
Fax: (215) 923-9302
dnast@nastlaw.com

Patrick W. Pendley – ***Chair, Damages Committee***
Christopher Coffin – ***State Liaison Committee***
PENDLEY, BAUDIN & COFFIN, LLP
Post Office Drawer 71
Plaquemine, LA 70765
Tel: (225) 687-6369
pwpendley@pbclawfirm.com
ccoffin@pbclawfirm.com

Edgar D. Gankendorff – ***Co-Head Chair, Litigation Committee***
Eric R.G. Belin – ***Damages Committee***
PROVOSTY & GANKENDORFF, LLC
650 Poydras Street, Suite 2700
New Orleans, LA 70130
Tel: (504) 410-2795
Fax: (504) 410-2796
egankendorff@provostylaw.com
ebelin@provostylaw.com

Richard Rouco – ***Written Submissions Committee***
QUINN, CONNOR, WEAVER, DAVIES & ROUCO LLP
2 – 20th Street North, Suite 930
Birmingham, AL 35203
Tel: (205) 870-9989
Fax: (205) 870-9989
rrouco@qcwdr.com

Garrett Blanchfield – ***Written Submissions Committee***
REINHARDT, WENDORF & BLANCHFIELD
E-1250 First National Bank Building
332 Minnesota Street
St. Paul, MN 55101
Tel: (651) 287-2100
Fax: (651) 287-2103
g.blanchfield@rwblawfirm.com

Jason Thompson – ***Damages Committee***
SOMMERS SCHWARTZ
One Towne Square, 17th Floor
Southfield, MI 48076
Tel: (248) 355-0300
jthompson@sommerspc.com

Eric L. Cramer – *Expert Committee*
BERGER & MONTAGUE, P.C.
1622 Locust Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Tel: 1-800-424-6690
Fax: (215) 875-4604
ecramer@bm.net

Counsel for Subscriber Plaintiffs

/s/ Warren T. Burns
Warren T. Burns
BURNS CHAREST LLP
900 Jackson Street, Suite 500
Dallas, Texas 75202
Tel: (469) 904-4550
Fax: (469) 444-5002
wburns@burnscharest.com

Counsel for Self-Funded Sub-Class

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on June 9, 2021, the foregoing Notice of Supplemental Authority was filed with the Clerk of the Court and served on counsel of record via ECF.

/s/ Michael D. Hausfeld

Michael D. Hausfeld